



University of
Zurich^{UZH}

Department of Social Anthropology and Cultural Studies



2

Working Paper No.

ZANTHRO

Zurich Anthropology
Working Papers

**From cheap commodity to prestige item –
Hanoians longing for clean and safe vegetables**

– Sandra Kurfürst

© 2017 SANDRA KURFÜRST

ZANTHRO - Zurich Anthropology Working Papers

Published by
ISEK – Ethnologie
Andreasstrasse 15
CH 8050 Zurich

zanthro@isek.uzh.ch

Editorial Board:
Sandra Bärnreuther
Annuska Derks
Molly Fitzpatrick
Heinz Käufeler
Olivia Killias
Matthew Parsfield
Francesca Rickli
Irina Wenk

Graphic Design:
University of Zurich, Information Technology, MELS/SIVIC, Sarah Steinbacher

Cover Photo:
Sandra Kurfürst

ISSN: 2571-6190

From Cheap Commodity to Prestige Item - Hanoians Longing for Clean and Safe Vegetables

SANDRA KURFÜRST, INSTITUTE OF SOUTH ASIAN AND SOUTHEAST ASIAN STUDIES – UNIVERSITY OF COLOGNE

Access to food, water, shelter and air are major preconditions for living in the city, like anywhere else. They constitute what Parnell and Pieterse (2010: 148) in their discussion of the 'right to the city' refer to as 'basic or 1st generation human rights'. However, particularly the first right of access to food has only recently moved into the analytical focus of urban studies (Morgan, 2015). The 'urban food question' (Morgan, 2015) is often linked to the topics of food deserts (e.g. Weatherspoon et al., 2015; Whelan et al., 2002) and food security (e.g. Barthel et al., 2015; Crush, 2014; Morgan, 2015). The former frequently being linked to the cities of the Global North and the latter to cities of the Global South. So far, food safety, the concern for the products' origin, and the usage of chemicals in food processing has hardly been discussed in the context of Southern cities, where more and more consumers, in particular a rising urban middle-class, are concerned about the absence of food standards and the danger this poses to their families' health. This paper presents urbanites responses to these perceived dangers with empirical reference to urban Vietnam. In Vietnamese cities residents are increasingly in search of 'clean and safe vegetables' (*rau sạch, rau an toàn*).

Using results from fieldwork in Hanoi, this paper presents three strategies urbanites use to ensure food safety in the fresh produce they eat, namely 1) maintaining the daily practice of buying from local vendors, 2) receiving boxes of fresh produce sent to the city by relatives and friends residing in the countryside, and 3) cultivating herbs and vegetables at home in roof top gardens or on fallow urban land. Although widely adopted, all three strategies cannot guarantee urbanites' provision with safe produce according to international standards like the standard for food safety ISO 22000 or GlobalGAP¹. For example, interviewees receiving fresh produce from rural areas did not refer to such standards or used the concept 'organic' in describing them, as in Western definitions. Likewise, the interviewed gardeners were not concerned with the origin of the soil and the seeds they used to grow their own food, nor did they worry about the degree of air pollution in the city. Rather the practices discussed in the following build upon local perceptions of 'clean and safe'. Therefore the presented research is interested in people's social constructions of

¹ ISO 22000 developed by the International Organization for Standardization is the international norm for food safety. It defines the requirements for organisations in food value chains. GlobalGAP is a private standard that aims to define 'Good Agricultural Practice' (GAP) concerning food safety, environmental protection, quality, labour protection etc.. The standard was introduced in 1997 by the Organisation Foodplus, an alliance of traders and suppliers of fresh produce. Besides GlobalGAP national benchmarks do exist (Dannenberg, 2011: 239). For example, Vietnam has developed VietGAP (for more information see <http://www.vietgap.com>). /

what they perceive to be clean and safe vegetables and how they ascribe new values to a well-known and usually cheap commodity.

From the analysis of these strategies two main arguments are developed: First, urbanites actively shorten agricultural wholesale commodity chains in order to ensure food safety. By re-embedding the economic exchange into social relationships of trust and cultivating food at home, the value of vegetables and herbs in urban Vietnam is transformed. The value is not solely determined by the monetary exchange value, but is assigned with a social exchange value as well. The paper concludes that the commodity of fresh vegetables is being taken out of its usual commodity sphere, signifying the beginning of a process of 'singularization', by which Kopytoff (1986: 65) refers to the process of de-commodification. According to Kopytoff (1986: 71), a thing can be a commodity exchangeable for another thing at one point in time, but it can be de-commodified at another, which means that it does not fit into a uniform category of value along with other things any longer. The paper's arguments follow from literature on the role of trust in economic relationships (Dannenberg, 2011; Evers, 1995; Gerber et al., 2014) and on the production of value (Graeber, 2001; Kockelman, 2012; Kopytoff, 1986). Second, in the light of food safety, rural-urban relations are strengthened and reevaluated. Urbanites draw on rural-urban relationships and adopt rural practices, such as the cultivation of food, in order to receive safe food in the city. The paper argues that this reevaluation of both rural-urban relations and practices identifies an affirmation of urban life. It represents urbanites' social creativity in dealing with the everyday challenges and contingencies of the city. This point contributes to the general debate in urban studies on the contested relevance of the distinction between the rural and the urban (e.g. Brenner, 2014; Krause, 2013; Lefebvre, 1970), and the particular debate in Vietnamese studies on the rural-urban binary (Drummond, 2003; Gillen, 2016; Harms, 2010; Kurfürst, 2012a; Labbé, 2016).

This research is drawn from fieldwork conducted between September 2014 and October 2015 in Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City. The data were gathered using qualitative methods: interviews and site-visits at gardens. The sections on the creation of trust through face-to-face interactions, rural-urban supply and urban gardens are based on 44 semi-structured and narrative interviews with urban consumers of fresh produce, urban gardeners and market vendors at the local Yên Phụ, and the larger wholesale Long Biên market. Additionally, expert interviews were carried out with Vietnamese historians and social anthropologists.

Framing the concern for food safety in urban Vietnam

The rising awareness for food safety in Vietnam goes hand in hand with an increasing mediatization of society. Newspapers, television and online fora increasingly report about food scandals and food poisoning, particularly with respect to the usage of agrochemicals in agricultural production. As 35-year-old Hà puts it 'Everyone knows about food poisoning. Farmers use fertilizers and pesticides (...) It is everywhere, in the media, the newspaper. They run tests and explain that vegetables are contaminated'.

A study from 2012 conducted in eight provinces with 1050 vegetable samples showed that 51.24% contained too many pesticides according to WHO standards and 47% comprised exceeding amounts of nitrate and heavy metal substances. Another study of the Hanoi

Medical University found that 72% of the 660 vegetable samples collected in Hanoi and Nam Dinh had *E. coli* bacteria (The Anh et al., 2012). In 2015, the Vietnam Food Administration reported 171 cases of food poisoning. Food poisoning and food scandals affected 5,000 people with 23 deaths (Vietnam Plus, 2016).

The concern about clean and safe produce has become an integral part of urban dwellers' everyday life: when friends and co-workers meet for lunch at small restaurants, when parents buy fresh products at local markets, or when families dine together, they all discuss the origin of the vegetables and the safety of the food. In other words, 'clean and safe vegetables' has evolved into an urban idiom. It is an urban idiom and at the same time it is 'hyperreal' (Baudrillard, 1988). Baudrillard (1988) introduced the notion of 'hyperreality' in order to describe reality's replacement with signs and symbols in a media and information saturated world, and thence the vanishing of reality itself. As a result of systematic simulation symbols increasingly substitute actual experiences and objects. Consequently, images lose their referents. Ha's quote shows that the images of 'clean and safe' produce have lost their referents. The symbol of 'clean and safe' increasingly replaces the 'real' safe food that is ideally not contaminated with agrochemicals. This symbol is interpreted quite differently by the multiple actors involved in the urban food question. It is against the background of the hyperreal that the strategies presented in the following need to be analyzed. They are not to guarantee clean and safe food according to international/national standards like ISO 22000 or VietGAP, but they do represent people's social constructions of what they imagine to be clean, safe, and fresh foods.

Agricultural Commodity Chains

Vegetables and herbs are an integral ingredient of every Vietnamese meal (*món ăn*). Every dish is accompanied by cooked leafy greens and a plate of aromatic herbs and lettuce. According to Avieli (2012: 27) 'greens are essential, contributing to several dimensions of the meal: nutrition (adding fiber, vitamins and minerals), texture, color, fragrance and taste'. Accordingly, vegetables and herbs are sold at almost every street corner, as well as in supermarkets. Particularly seasonal greens are easy to afford, even for households with low incomes. For example, a bundle of fresh herbs currently costs 4,000-6,000 VND (0.15-0.23 Euro). Consequently, it is not the access to fresh produce that poses a problem for urbanites but the uncertainty about the products' quality and origin.

Tracing agricultural commodity chains in Northern Vietnam, Gerber et al. (2014) found that particularly the vegetable commodity chains are highly diversified. Over two-thirds of vegetables consumed in Vietnam's capital originate from Hanoi's peri-urban region, while the rest is imported from the highlands in Southern Vietnam around Đà Lạt or from China. Much of this produce is exchanged at one of the city's four major wholesale markets. From there it passes on to restaurants or neighborhood markets with the remainder being sold by mobile street vendors (Gerber et al., 2014). The complexity and diversity of these commodity chains means that the tracing back of agricultural products to their sites of origin is a difficult task for consumers. Particularly difficult is generating information on environmental impacts. Bolwig et al. (2010) note that the environmental impacts of value chains, such as pesticides, additives and chemicals used in food processing and cleaning, may be triggered at one place, but can well reach beyond the area of origin. These environmental problems are often related to activities in a particular node of a value chain, for

example at the point in the value chain where a product is exchanged or undergoes a major transformation or processing, e.g. production, transportation, or storage (Bolwig et al., 2010)². Even in highly standardized and monitored value chains, there are diverse ways for the different actors involved in the chain to supply the consumer with products that do not fulfill the consumers' demand, yet without the consumer noticing it (Dannenberg, 2011). As a result, consumers find it increasingly difficult to decipher the nodes and segments of value chains, and have the feeling of facing a great amount of uncertainty when purchasing fresh produce.

In his theory of social reflexivity, Giddens (2001) argues that the notion of risk needs to be understood in relation to trust. Trust is required in order to cope with the increasing insecurities and risks in a globalized world. Trust implies having confidence in abstract systems and institutions such as in contracts or authorities for food regulation. Where such regulations or the monitoring thereof are missing, social capital has become an important resource to draw on (see for example Mutz and Klump, 2005; Koh, 2006). Gerber et al. (2014) show how social capital helps to overcome institutional gaps in agricultural wholesale commodity chains in Northern Vietnam. Due to shortcomings in the regulatory framework and monitoring of the commodity chains, the actors in these chains need to rely on relationships of trust with their business partners. Such relationships of trust emerge between wholesale traders and local vendors, sellers and end consumers etc. (Gerber et al., 2014). Here, the reference to social capital ensures the smooth functioning of economic transactions at each node of the agricultural commodity chain. Accordingly, social capital is maintained as a 'collective property resource' (Korff and Rothfuß, 2009: 363), in an environment where abstract systems of regulation or control seem to be missing or are not trusted. For consumers the building of relationships of trust with sellers is a way to reduce the uncertainty they are confronted with in the anonymous agricultural commodity chains (Dannenberg and Kulke, 2014). Accordingly, many Hanoians maintain their daily practice of buying directly from market and street vendors in the city or in the countryside or receive boxes of fresh produce from rural residents they trust. This (re-)embedding of economic processes in social networks is not a characteristic limited to traditional societies as suggested by Polanyi (1977), but occurs each time markets expand (Evers, 1995).

Production of value

Such re-embedding of food supply in social relationships also transforms the value of the usually cheap and easy affordable commodity. In *Toward an Anthropological Theory of Value* Graeber (2001: 1–2) differentiates between three definitions of value: First, value is what makes a meaningful difference. Second, value can be measured by the willingness to give something up for something else. Third, value is what is desirable and good. In the light of food safety, the symbol of 'clean and safe' is exactly what makes the difference when buying or receiving vegetables, and sets vegetables from trusted sources apart from the usual fresh produce sold at the market. Furthermore, the index 'clean and safe' is also

² Bolwig et al. (2010: 175) differentiate between 'nodes' and 'segments' of global value chains. A segment connects two nodes. For example, a segment exists between production and export or import and retail.

what makes the vegetables desirable and good. The second definition of value is based on the logic of equivalence. Kopytoff (1986: 71) states:

The problem of value and value equivalence has always been a philosophical conundrum in economics. It involves the mysterious process by which things that are patently unlike are somehow made to be alike with respect to value, making yams, for example, somehow comparable to and exchangeable with a mortar or a pot. In the terms we have been using here, this involves taking the patently singular and inserting it into a uniform category of value with other patently singular things.

Kopytoff (1986: 68) defines a commodity as “a thing that has use value and that can be exchanged in a discrete transaction for a counterpart, the very fact of exchange indicating that the counterpart, has in the immediate context, an equivalent value”. However, to Kopytoff (1986: 68) an object’s value is not solely determined by the amount of labour that is required to produce it, but also by its cultural biography. In fact, a thing can have multiple biographies, such as social, economic or technical, that all determine its value. Furthermore, he alludes to the dynamic processes of commoditization and singularization (Kopytoff, 1986: 83). A thing can be almost valueless at one point, like vegetables and herbs in Vietnam, which usually are of little monetary value, and may become priceless at another point, like ‘safe and clean’ vegetables that are currently turned into a prestige item in Hanoi.

The following section discusses the state’s attempt to attain control and to assign responsibilities for food safety in the segments of agricultural commodity chains. The empirical data hints at citizens’ distrust in the control and monitoring system stipulated by the state. This discussion is followed by one on the rise of supermarkets, which are promoted by the state as warrantors of food safety. Again, this state initiative does not receive much acceptance by urban dwellers. The main part of the paper, divided into three empirical sections, then investigates urbanites’ strategies to ensure food safety.

The state’s attempts at food safety

During the last decade, the Vietnamese government has undertaken diverse efforts to establish a control system along the segments of value chains. Already in 1995 the government introduced the ‘safe vegetables’ program. The program comprised training as well as technical support for farmers to improve the management of irrigation water, fertilization, as well as the application of pesticides (Mergenthaler et al., 2009).

The current legislation consists of two laws, one more generally targeting the quality of products and goods and the other directly addressing food safety. According to the 2008 Law on the Quality of Products and Goods, manufacturers and traders are held responsible for the quality of their products, while the overall control of the quality of goods, including food products, is assigned to the Ministry of Science and Technology. The 2011 Law on Food Safety establishes the rights and obligations of organizations and individuals with respect to food safety, the business conditions to ensure food safety and the advertising and labelling of food products, etc. The overall responsibility for the testing and enforcement of food safety is assigned to the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development and the Ministry of Industry and Trade (Van Nguyen, 2014).

Even before the passing of these laws, two important decisions were made in 2007, the year cholera reappeared in Hanoi. The government and the municipality both identified the lack of hygiene and awareness of the careful preparation of food as the main causes of the outbreak. Therefore, immediately after the outbreak, the municipality of Hanoi started public awareness-raising campaigns. In the same year, the Prime Minister signed Decision 149/2007/QĐ-TTg. Among other measures, this program sought to ensure food hygiene and safety in producing, preserving, and processing agricultural products. Furthermore, the program particularly aimed at ensuring street-food hygiene and safety. With respect to agricultural production, Decision 102/2007/QĐ-BNN of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development further defines the legal utilization of fertilizers. The decision supplements 155 fertilizers that can be produced, sold and used in Vietnam (Bo Nong Nghiep va Phat Trien Nong Thon, 2016). Although this legal framework exists, most citizens complain that producers' and suppliers' adherence to the regulation is not properly monitored.

For modern retail outlets, the government has additionally introduced a certificate for vegetables. The certificate testifies that vegetables are produced in line with the national regulations on the production of safe vegetables (Wertheim-Heck et al., 2014b). Overall, the presented policies aim at the promotion of supermarkets, and the reduction of local markets and street trade.

The rise of supermarkets

Like in other countries in Southeast Asia, the development of supermarkets in Vietnam is regarded as essential to ensure food safety. The 'supermarketization' initiated by the Vietnamese government targets the restructuring of existing modes of food provisioning, and thence the reduction of traditional markets (Wertheim-Heck et al., 2015: 95-96). The first big supermarkets were built in Hanoi around the turn of the millennium in the two central districts of Hoàn Kiếm and Hai Bà Trưng. One was established in the upper floor of what was then the first shopping mall of Hanoi, Tràng Tiền Plaza, another in the basement of the Hanoi Towers at Hai Bà Trưng St, which is where multinational companies and international donors are located. By 2005/6, larger supermarkets had already emerged at the Southern urban fringe such as Big C in the district of Thành Xuân and later Metro in Hoàng Mai District. These supermarkets had a twofold appeal for consumers. First, their modern outer appearance and sanitized interior appeared to promise hygienic and healthy products. Second, the storage racks offered global products that until then had hardly been available in Vietnam. Going shopping in the supermarket became a sign of distinction and of status. The ascribed value of distinction was equalled by a monetary value that made these goods only affordable to particular social groups with high enough incomes.

Yet, the purchase of goods in supermarkets cannot be simply reduced to forms of 'conspicuous consumption' in Veblen's (1899) terms. On the contrary, supermarkets offer a wide array of everyday products that urban dwellers need for their daily food. In particular in the New Urban Areas (NUA) of Hanoi, supermarkets are often the sole provider of fresh products. For example, in 2005, the inhabitants of the then quite recently built NUA of Ciputra and Trung Hòa Nhân Chính found themselves in a dilemma: On the one hand, they could not afford to buy in the supermarkets because the goods there were too expen-

sive. On the other hand, purchasing fresh products from local markets or street vendors in the area was not an immediate option since they were just not available in the neighborhood. The NUA had been built on agricultural land lacking a generic infrastructure such as local markets (Labbé and Boudreau, 2011). Supermarkets were the only places to turn to. Interviewees explained that they would still purchase vegetables, fruits, meat and fish from the local markets in their old neighborhoods, which they had left for a higher quality of life in the condominiums or villas of the NUA.

The promotion of supermarkets also affected the system of established urban markets. The 'Decision of the Prime Minister Approving the Program on the Development of Marketplaces until 2010' promulgates the upgrading of marketplaces in urban areas and the construction of supermarkets (Gerber et al., 2014). Big markets that had been the economic center of the city for centuries were torn down, making space for new large-scale developments such as supermarkets and shopping malls (Endres, 2014; Geertman, 2011). Most of the old markets occupied urban land of high economic value. An example is Chợ Cửa Nam, the origin of which dates back to Hanoi's role as royal city. The royal citadel was surrounded by a rectangular wall with four gates in the directions of the cardinal points. In front of the gates, permanent and periodical markets were held (Logan, 2000). Cửa Nam, translating into Southern Gate, was one of these gates, where markets were periodically held. In 2010, right in time for Hanoi's 1000th anniversary, a new commercial center opened on this site. In the basement of the 13-stories-high-rise building a supermarket offers vegetables, meat, fish and beverages, while the remaining floors are used as office space and a car park. However, many of the upgraded markets remain empty and are not generally accepted by urban consumers.

Catering to the demand for safe and clean fresh produce, a new shop model has evolved in Hanoi. So-called safe foods shops (*cửa hàng thực phẩm an toàn*) are mushrooming all over the city. These privately owned shops actually fill the gap between the anonymous purchase in supermarkets and the personal interaction with traders at the local markets. The shops all carry a big green logo saying 'safe foods'. The label frequently comes with a photo displaying a beautiful basket of fresh vegetables and fruits and sometimes meat. Although the logo and photo suggest some form of standardization and certification, most shop owners seem to interpret the label of safe foods quite differently. For example, the safe foods shop at Yên Phụ St. in Tây Hồ District only offers imported goods. These goods comprise of fresh produce from New Zealand, Italian Barilla noodles and German Haribo. Vegetables, fruits and meat are packed in plastic and kept in the refrigerator. The vegetables carry a label indicating that they are imported from New Zealand, yet without any specifications and labels from New Zealand. By contrast, the safe foods shop in the NUA Linh Đàm, located approx. 8km south of the city center, is run by an elderly woman. Her portfolio is not as diverse as the one at Yên Phụ. She does not sell any imported fresh products at all. Asked about where her vegetables come from, she answered that she receives them from suppliers in her home province Nam Định, one hundred kilometer south of Hanoi. Likewise, there is no label indicating the safety of food, except for her verbal insurance.

Consequently, the labeling of food – be it verbally or indicatively - has become an important marketing point. The idiom and hyperreality of clean and safe vegetables has opened up a space for negotiation and for marketing, as diverse providers seek to cater to the demand for safe fresh produce. The idiom is even appropriated by street vendors in

Hanoi. At 5 pm, the peak of the rush hour, a street vendor offers her commodities in a small basket on the road side in Hanoi's Ancient Quarter with a green sign indicating 'safe vegetables for sale'. The adoption of the label by street vendors is particularly interesting since authorities have blamed street trade for the lack of hygiene and for creating health hazards. Indeed, since the 1990s, the municipal authorities have conducted several attempts to eradicate street trade from the urban landscape (Koh, 2006). When cholera broke out again in Hanoi in the winter of 2007, shrimp paste, which is commonly sold at local markets or served at mobile food stalls, was blamed for causing the infection. Shortly thereafter in 2008, the municipality of Hanoi ordered a ban on street trade in 64 streets of the city center (Kurfürst, 2012b; Turner and Schoenberger, 2012). However, so far this policy has not yielded the desired results. Instead of finding themselves in decline, street markets have mushroomed in Hanoi. Rather than turning to the promoted supermarkets, urban dwellers seem to stick to their daily routine of buying from street markets (Gerber et al., 2014; Wertheim-Heck et al., 2014b). In fact, the census by Wertheim-Heck et al. (2014b) shows that 95% of vegetables consumed in the city of Hanoi are exchanged at local markets or through street trade, and only 2.3% of the vegetables are traded in supermarkets and convenience stores. As a reason for the persistence of local markets Wertheim-Heck et al. (2015) mention the importance of trust in the buyer-seller relationship, as well as consumption habits, e.g. choice of shopping location (close to the home), opening hours, or the habit of daily shopping. In sum, the asynchronous development of the promotion of supermarkets as warrantor of safe foods and the persistence of local markets argues for a lack of trust in the national certificate and private wholesale regulations on food safety. In other words, the attempts at standardization have yet to result in the construction of trust among consumers. Meanwhile in an effort to respond to this uncertainty, urbanites have developed different strategies that are built around personal relationships based on trust.

Creating trust through face-to-face interactions

At local markets and between mobile street traders and consumers, economic exchange is embedded in a social relationship of trust. The sensory experience of being able to touch, smell or even taste the fresh produce increases trust between the seller and buyer (Mele et al., 2015).

Through the daily face-to-face interactions at the market, sellers and buyers create 'bridging social capital' - social relationships with people different from oneself but acting in the same social field (Putnam, 2000: 20). Consumers will usually buy particular goods from different stalls, depending on recommendations from others and their own experience of the quality of goods offered at the market stalls. If the quality of the produce is low, consumers will know whom to blame.

Thảo reports that her mother has been buying from one particular street vendor, who delivered the goods right to their doorstep, for years. The vendor maintained that the vegetables were fresh, coming directly from her village. Thảo told her mother that the vegetables did not come from the countryside but from the urban Long Biên Island in the Red River or were even imported from China. Nonetheless, her mother kept on buying from the street vendor. The mother insisted that the vendor would not dare to cheat on the origin of her produce since she knew the trader well. Through the daily interaction with the vendor and the ability to touch and smell the fresh produce, she established a relation-

ship of trust. The case illustrates how 'fresh', 'clean' and 'safe' have come to connote the products' rural origin. In order to be fresh and safe, vegetables are considered to have to come directly from rural areas, or more precisely the village, and not peri-urban areas such as Long Biên Island. This appraisal hints towards the different evaluative techniques urbanites apply to assess food safety. They maneuver between utility-based and value-based evaluative techniques, the former referring to instrumental rationality, and the latter to value rationality (Weber, 1978). The instrumental values underlying preferences for one agricultural product over another might be tied to price, certification, or the products' origin (such as being imported from New Zealand or Germany). In contrast, value rationality implies that 'the relative desirability of two options makes sense because of some aesthetic, ethical, or religious ideal. Such ideals make unconditional demands on us, and we value them for their own sake, independently of our prospects for success' (Kockelman, 2012: 193). The evaluation of those agricultural products that are delivered directly from the countryside as clean and safe appears to be value-based. It is informed by the prevalent imagery of the countryside in Vietnam as being less polluted than the city (Gillen, 2016; Fuhrmann, 2015). In Vietnamese society, rural life is seen as the cradle of Vietnamese culture. As is the case in many other societies, the countryside is imagined as the place of tradition, intact social ties and close contact to nature in contrast to the city that is often associated with pollution, alienation and disorder (Drummond, 2003; Kurfürst, 2012a; Labbé, 2016). Such binaries of the city and the countryside are charged with symbolic meanings in Vietnam (Harms, 2010). Actors continuously (re-)create and apply these binary concepts to make sense of their life world. Harms (2010) points to the symbolic power of rural-urban relations. In the search for clean and safe vegetables, these rural-urban relations are reevaluated and ascribed new meanings. The socially produced oppositions of the rural and the urban not only inform the way people imagine (urban) space (Gillen, 2016; Harms, 2010), but also what they imagine to be 'clean and safe vegetables'. Of course, the adoption of different evaluative techniques can result in a discrepancy between what is certified as safe foods by global/national standards (degree of contamination with agrochemicals or bacteria) and local perceptions of clean and safe (rural origin, trusted seller). As Ehlert and Vossemer (2015: 20) note customers maneuver 'in different markets and settings of food distribution by drawing on and combining diverse forms of knowledge'.

Rural-urban supply

Another trust-based strategy is the direct supply of urban households with fresh produce from the countryside. Interviewees reported that they received boxes of fresh vegetables and meat (pork and beef) from their relatives back home in rural areas. The examples of Trung and Duy demonstrate the strong rural-urban exchange of fresh commodities based on social relationships. Trung, a father of two, comes from Hạ Long Bay in Quảng Ninh Province. Each month his family sends him by car a box with fresh seafood such as shrimps and crabs as well as some vegetables.

Duy comes from a rural area of Vĩnh Phúc Province, located 40 km outside the city. When he returns home to visit his parents, he brings herbs and vegetables for his friends with small children in Hanoi. This practice is shared widely by many Hanoians. Since many urbanites have migrated from the countryside to the city, their rural-urban connections

are still strong. On occasions such as weddings, anniversaries of deaths and particularly the Vietnamese lunar New Year, they return home to their families (*về quê*). Upon returning to Hanoi, they bring fresh produce from their rural places of origin back to the city. Other interviewees report that they purchase vegetables, herbs and fruits while on business trips in the countryside. For example, Quang is currently working as an advisor for the World Bank in a project in Thanh Hóa Province. Whenever he is on a business trip in Thanh Hóa or he visits his home town in Hưng Yên Province, he buys fresh vegetables for his family. Likewise, Nhiên, a 38-year-old teacher, buys vegetables in her home province of Thái Nguyên or when she visits the countryside for business.

The cases show that once again face-to-face interactions between sellers and buyers appear to be crucial for creating trust. Urbanites go directly to the countryside to buy fresh produce. When they are not able to go there themselves, the immediate exchange between seller and end consumer is substituted by a seller-middlemen relationship. Middlemen are trusted persons, most commonly relatives and friends. Sometimes middlemen are also a friend's relatives residing in the countryside, who organize the supply with agricultural products. Through the exchange of boxes of fresh food between relatives and friends, de-commoditized chains of food supply are established. Drawing on their rural-urban social relations, urbanites challenge and actually bypass agricultural wholesale commodity chains. Consequently, the fresh produce is pulled out of its commodity sphere. By embedding the supply with fresh produce in social relationships, the exchange value of vegetables and herbs is transformed.

Changing values

In his study of the multi-centric economy of the Tiv in Nigeria, Bohannan (1959) distinguishes between three spheres of exchange: 1. The sphere of subsistence items, with subsistence items comprising e.g. cereals, chickens, goats, tools, etc. 2. The sphere of prestige items (such as slaves, cattle, medicine or special cloth) 3. The sphere of rights-in-people (marriageable female relatives). Each sphere has its own morality. Although in the first sphere of subsistence items, goods are distributed by gift giving or marketing, Bohannan (1959: 493) argues that this economic sphere is governed by 'the morality of the free and uncontrolled market'³. By contrast, the second sphere of prestige items is not associated with the market at all. Goods belonging to this sphere never entered the market but were exchanged on occasions such as ceremonies, ritualized wealth displays etc. (Bohannan, 1959).

This distinction between the first and second commodity spheres as two 'separate universes of exchange values' (Kopytoff, 1986: 71) assists in understanding the change of exchange value that is occurring with respect to agricultural products in contemporary urban Vietnam. In the cases presented above, the commodity of fresh produce is taken out of its sphere of subsistence items and transferred to a sphere of prestige items. Bundles of seasonal and regional vegetables and herbs are of little monetary value. However, by importing vegetables to the city on the basis of social relationships, the value of vegetables and herbs changes and increases. The former low market exchange value is amended by a social exchange value. 35-year-old Hà, a mother of two, says 'vegetables are the best

³ This sphere originally did not involve money; all goods were exchanged by barter (Bohannan, 1959).

present from parents these days'. The commodity that is equivalent to only little money in the market economy has become a prestige item and a popular gift of high social value among friends and relatives⁴.

Roof top gardens and urban green

Apart from receiving fresh produce from the countryside, the cultivation of vegetables and herbs at home has become a common strategy among the city dwellers, particularly the urban middle-class, to attain clean and safe produce. Urbanites grow food on rooftops, balconies, in recycled fruit boxes and milk packages as well as on fallow urban land. In an interview, Prof. Tô Ngọc Thành, Director of the Vietnamese Society of Social and Cultural Anthropologists, explains that gardens have always been an integral part of Vietnamese everyday life. In the countryside, the garden made up at least 1/3 of the land lot. Yet, with the move from the countryside to the city, the spatial outline of houses changed. The so-called tube houses (*nhà ống*), which can be found throughout urban areas in Vietnam, have a very narrow front, with often only one room per floor, but several floors. In fact, the horizontal style of houses was changed into a vertical one. The upper floor of most houses has multiple functions. This floor is often divided into two parts. The inner space is foremost used as the space where the ancestors are worshipped on a small altar. By contrast, the outer space comprises a small rooftop terrace, on which the house's facilities such as the reservoir for fresh water and the air conditioning are located. With the striving for clean and safe food this outer space is being used to cultivate vegetables and herbs. These spaces of cultivation signify the house owner's wealth. The building of large rooftop gardens has become a sign of social and economic distinction as the following three cases illustrate.

Anh and Hoa live together with their two children and a female house-keeper in a spacious 5-storey house with a roof top garden in Bắc Từ Liêm, an urban district in the western part of Hanoi. They own a private business in the health sector. The office is located on the first floor. On the 2nd floor, the family's socio-economic status is displayed through a big TV screen, a large aquarium, and the wall decorated with souvenirs from abroad such as a plate with the Eiffel Tower in Paris and a miniature Taj Mahal. The family's bedrooms are situated on the 3rd floor and the kitchen is installed on the 4th floor. The 5th and last floor is divided into an inner space with the ancestors' altar and an outer space consisting of the roof-top garden. The house maid, who refers to herself as 'the main vegetable cultivator', names the different kinds of vegetables and herbs she grows here: garlic, onions, chilies, chive, and different kinds of cabbage, tomatoes, and leafy greens that are used to cook the soup that is served with almost any Vietnamese dish (*canh*). To cultivate the fresh produce, she creatively employs diverse materials such as ceramic pots, in which ornamental trees are usually grown, old polystyrene fruit boxes from the market as well as cut up water bottles hanging upside down. Asked about her motivation for gardening, she answers that she likes to grow vegetables for relaxation and to reduce

⁴ Food has always occupied an important role in gift exchange in Vietnam (Avieli, 2012). Yet, most of the food exchanged as gifts on occasions such as weddings or festivals is processed foods. Bundles of vegetables and herbs do not form a part of the gift portfolio.

stress. Of course, she uses the home-grown produce to cook the meals for the children, but she buys additional ingredients from the local Đồng Xa market.

Lan, is a 38-year old lecturer. She lives in a house in the Thành Trì District, a designated rural district of Hanoi. Lan uses many of the open spaces in her house to grow vegetables as well as medicinal herbs, utilizing diverse materials such as fruit boxes and ceramic pots to grow the greens. In the courtyard of her house, she even keeps chickens. She gardens not only because she is concerned about safe vegetables but also because she enjoys the beauty and fragrance of the plants. Being a working mother, she cannot keep up with the gardening on her own. That is why her aunt, who moved from her rural hometown to live with her in Hanoi, assists her.

Vân Anh lives together with her husband and two children in a generic housing area in Hanoi's Southern Thành Xuân District. The area is characterized by the typical small alleys that become narrower the deeper one gets into the housing area. In contrast to the usual tube houses, Vân Anh's house has three spacious floors of approx. 50 m² each. The kitchen is located on the first floor. The second and third floors house the family's bedrooms. The garden is located on the roof-top. It occupies an area of approx. 50 m². Vân Anh explains that her family completely rebuilt the house two years ago. It was then that they decided to build a roof-top garden. The planting beds are made of concrete. To fill them, they ordered three soil transporters. This weight requires a specific structural analysis of the house and thus a superior building material than usually applied when constructing houses in Vietnam. In their rooftop garden, Vân Anh and her husband grow tomatoes, garlic, potatoes, beans, kohlrabi etc. to such an extent that they are completely self-sufficient. 'Last year we had 2 dozen kilos of tomatoes', she says displaying a photo of her harvest on her mobile phone. She likes to garden for fun as well as to prepare her own food. Nonetheless, she still continues to buy additional supplies such as fruit from the neighborhood market. In sum, urban subsistence production is no longer limited to the urban poor as previous research on Southeast Asian cities suggests (Forbes, 1996; Mc Gee, 1967), but is increasingly being conducted by an emergent urban middle-class that can afford the construction of a roof top garden and the personnel to look after the greenery.

Commoning: filling urban green with meaning

In many better-off housing areas such the Bắc Từ Liêm and the Tây Hồ District, public spaces and wasteland are appropriated by individuals to cultivate their own food. Bắc Từ Liêm is an area that rapidly urbanized within the last ten years, now consisting of spacious one family houses with a dominantly middle-class population. Previously, the area consisted mainly of paddy fields. Today many families grow chilies, lemons, garlic and *rau ngót Nhật* (*diciptera chinensis*, a leafy green used to cook soup) in ceramic pots or recycled fruit boxes on the streets and sidewalks in front of their houses. 'As long as they [the vegetable boxes] stay in front of their houses no one cares. [...] From the vegetables you can tell, where families with little children live' (Mai, 40 years old, translated from Vietnamese).

The Tây Hồ District, bordering the West Lake in the North West, used to be famous for its plantations of *đào/quất*, the traditional Vietnamese Lunar New Year tree. Yet, since the 1990s, great parts of the former agricultural land have been transformed into building land.

Today it is a district popular among the better-off and expats living in Hanoi. The area is characterized by spacious one-family houses in walled compounds. In some streets, such as Đặng Thai Mai Street, a number of nurseries are still witness to the land's former usage. From Đặng Thai Mai Street, a small private street leads into a dead end that is surrounded by newly built one family houses. A designated flower bed of 15x3m is located right in the middle. In October 2014, the lot lay idle except for some palm tree seedlings. In between the seedlings, residents had planted egg plants and morning glory. A woman taking care of the vegetables declared the vegetables as clean and safe. According to her, only the people living in the immediate neighborhood had access to the land. One year later in October 2015, the urban green on the lot had become quite dense. Interviewees residing in the area explained that the lot is managed by the municipality, which plans to beautify the lot with greenery. While the land is lying idle, the residents of the neighborhood use the land to plant vegetables. This temporary usage of fallow land for gardening is a very common practice in Hanoi. Individuals occupy construction land in order to grow vegetables. Often a development plan already exists. Yet, as long as the constructions have not started, this kind of interim usage is tolerated by the authorities. That is how urban dwellers make use and sense of the urban green surrounding them. By planting greenery, urbanites literally fill fallow land with meaning. Access to the land and the permission to harvest are subject to the social control within the neighborhood.

'Here the people living in the area grow vegetables. This is state land, but it is not used. There is a plan to plant flowers on the lot, but it has not yet been realized. That is why the people cultivate the land. Everyone who likes to can use the lot' (Qùynh, 58 years old, Tây Hồ District, translated from Vietnamese).

This is what Harvey (2012) refers to as the social practice of commoning. 'This practice produces or establishes a social relation with a common whose uses are either exclusive to a social group or partially or fully open to all and sundry' (Harvey, 2012: 73). The relationship between the social group and this aspect of environment that is regarded as a common ought to be non-commodified, and thus outside the market logic. Such non-commodified usage of waste land for cultivation in Hanoi once again hints towards the bypassing of agricultural commodity chains and thus towards the de-commodification of vegetables.

Conclusion

The idiom and hyperreality of 'clean and safe vegetables' signifies urbanites' fear of consuming fresh produce that is contaminated with pesticides and herbicides. Urbanites respond to these anticipated dangers of eating in diverse ways. Since the national food regulation is not trusted, they adopt trust-based strategies, such as maintaining the daily practice of buying from local vendors, and receiving boxes of fresh produce sent to the city by relatives and friends residing in the countryside. Additionally, urbanites grow vegetables and herbs for their own consumption in rooftop gardens in the private space of the home or on urban wasteland, which is collectively used to cultivate food. From the analysis of these strategies two main arguments were developed: First, by re-embedding

their food supply into relationships of trust, the urbanites systematically shorten agricultural wholesale commodity chains in particular and global commodity chains in general. To put it in Kopytoff's (1986) terms, this indicates the beginning of a process of decommodification and singularization. Commodities are singularized by pulling them out of their usual commodity sphere (Kopytoff, 1986). For a long time, the monetary value of vegetables and herbs used to be equivalent to the availability and cost of their production. Since much of the fresh produce is easily grown in Vietnam or in neighboring countries, it is quite cheap and thus affordable to many urban households. Yet, by cultivating vegetables at home or obtaining them directly from rural areas, urbanites have entered a process of selection, selecting between what they consider safe and unsafe foods. In this process of selection both instrumentally rational and value rational evaluative techniques are applied. Consequently, the process of selection is accompanied by the process of significance (Kockelman, 2012: 12), as new meanings such as the value of safety are ascribed to the fresh produce.

According to Kopytoff (1986) the only moment the commodity status of a thing is not in question is the immediate moment of exchange. The commodities of vegetables and herbs are no longer exchanged based solely on monetary value but also based on the social value ascribed to them. They have become gifts among families and friends, too. The social value is produced through the *modus operandi* of exchange.

Second, in the light of food safety, urban residents renegotiate and reevaluate rural-urban binaries. For example, they draw on rural practices such as the cultivation of vegetables in the city. Asked about where she receives the practical knowledge to grow her own food, Lan answered 'Because I am a country girl'. The aforementioned house maid responded to the same question: 'In general, urbanites lack the experience'. These answers once again show how people make symbolic use of the binary categories of the rural and the urban, making sense of their life world. Krause (2013) stresses the importance of distinguishing between dimensions of the rural and the urban in order to understand how they are recombined. Accordingly, the creative employment of diverse materials and the urban built environment to grow food argues for an affirmation of urban life and urbanites' social creativity in dealing with the challenges and contingencies of the city.

Sandra Kurfürst is Junior Professor at the Institute of South Asian and Southeast Asian Studies, University of Cologne. An earlier version of this paper was presented at the Social Anthropology Colloquium of Zurich in October 2016.

Literature

- Avieli, Nir (2012) *Rice Talks: Food And Community In A Vietnamese Town*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Barthel, Stephan, John Parker and Henrik Ernstson (2015) Food and Green Space in Cities: A Resilience Lens on Gardens and Urban Environmental Movements. *Urban Studies* (52)7: 1321–1338.
- Baudrillard, Jean (1988) *Selected Writings*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Bo Nong Nghiep va Phat Trien Nong Thon (2016) Available at: <http://icd.mard.gov.vn/en/tabid/83/Default.aspx> (accessed 22 April 2016).
- Bohannon, Paul (1959) The Impact of Money on an African Subsistence Economy. *Journal of Economic History* 19: 491-503.

- Bolwig, Simon, Stefano Ponte, Andries Du Toit, Lone Rijsgaard and Niels Halberg (2010) Integrating Poverty and Environmental Concerns into Value-Chain Analysis: A Conceptual Framework. *Development Policy Review* 28(2): 173-194.
- Brenner, Neil (2014) Urban Theory without an outside. In: Brenner N. (ed) *Implosions/explosions. Towards a study of planetary urbanization*. Berlin: Jovis, pp. 14–35.
- Crush, Jonathan (2014) Approaching Food Security in Cities of the Global South. In: Parnell S and Oldfield S (eds) *The Routledge handbook on cities of the Global South*. London: Routledge, pp. 543–636.
- Dannenberg, Peter and Elmar Kulke (2014) Editorial: Dynamics in agricultural value chains. *Die Erde* 145(3): 121–126.
- Dannenberg, Peter (2011) Wege aus der Ausgrenzung - Informeller Umgang mit dem Standard GlobalGAP im kenianischen Gartenbau. *Geographische Zeitschrift* 99(4): 237-255.
- Drummond, Lisa (2003) Popular television and images of urban life. In: Drummond L and Thomas M (eds) *Consuming urban culture in contemporary Vietnam*. London: Routledge Curzon, pp.155–169.
- Ehlert, Judith and Christiane Vossemer (2015) Food sovereignty and conceptualization of agency: A methodological discussion. *ASEAS – Austrian Journal of South-East Asian Studies* 8(1): 7-26.
- Endres, Kirsten (2014) Downgraded by Upgrading: Small-scale Traders, Urban Transformation and Spatial Reconfiguration in Post-reform Vietnam. *The Cambridge Journal of Anthropology* 32(2): 97-111.
- Evers, Hans-Dieter (1995) *Globale Märkte und Soziale Transformation*. Working Paper No. 234. Sociology of Development Research Center. University of Bielefeld.
- Forbes, Dean (1996) *Asian Metropolis. Urbanisation and the Southeast Asian City*. Melbourne: Oxford University.
- Fuhrmann, Eva (2015) *Perceptions of Change in Vietnam: Human Environmental Values in Peri-urban Areas of Southeast Vietnam*. PhD Thesis, University of Bonn, Germany.
- Geertman, Stephanie (2011) Public Markets in the Corporate City. *Tap Chi Xay Dung* 2011.
- Gerber, Jonathan, Sarah Turner Sarah and Lynne B. Milgram (2014) Food Provisioning and Wholesale Agricultural Commodity Chains in Northern Vietnam. *Human Organization* 73(1): 50–61.
- Giddens, Anthony (2001) *Sociology*. Cambridge: Blackwell.
- Gillen, Jamie (2016) Bringing the countryside to the city: Practices and imaginations of the rural in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam. *Urban Studies* 53(2): 324–337.
- Graeber, David (2001) *Toward an anthropological theory of value: The false coin of our own dreams*. New York: Palgrave.
- Harms, Erik (2010) *Saigon's edge. On the margins of Ho Chi Minh City*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota.
- Harvey, David (2012) *Rebel Cities*. London: Verso Books.
- Kockelman, Paul (2012) *Agent, Person, Subject, Self*. Oxford: University Press.
- Koh, David (2006) *Wards of Hanoi*. Singapore: ISEAS.
- Kopytoff, Igor (1986) The cultural biography of things. Commoditization as process. In: Appadurai A (ed) *The social life of things. Commodities in cultural perspective*. New York: Cambridge University Press, pp.64–91.
- Korff, Rüdiger and Eberhard Rothfuß (2009) Urban Revolution a Catastrophe or Solution? Governance of Megacities in the Global South. *Die Erde* 140(4): 355-370.
- Krause, Monika (2013) The Ruralization of the World. *Public Culture* (25): 233–248.
- Kurfürst, Sandra (2012a) *Redefining Public Space in Hanoi. Places, Practices and Meaning*. Zürich: LIT.
- Kurfürst, Sandra (2012b) Informality as a strategy: Street traders facing constant insecurity. In: McFarlane C and Waibel M (eds) *Urban Informalities: Reflections on the Formal and Informal*. Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, pp.89-111.

- Labbé, Danielle and Julie-Anne Boudreau (2011) Understanding the causes of urban fragmentation in Hanoi: the case of new urban areas. *International Development and Planning Review* 33(3): 273–291.
- Labbé, Danielle (2016) Critical reflections on land appropriation and alternative urbanization trajectories in periurban Vietnam. *Cities* 53: 150-155.
- Lefebvre, Henri (1970) *La Révolution urbaine*. Paris: Gallimard.
- Logan, William (2000) *Hanoi. Biography of a City*. Seattle: University of Washington.
- Marx, Karl (1867) *Das Kapital. Kritik der Politischen Ökonomie*. Hamburg: Verlag Otto Meissner.
- McGee, Terry (1967) *The Southeast Asian City*. London: Bell.
- Mele, Christopher (2015) Urban markets as a 'corrective' to advanced urbanism: The social space of wet markets in contemporary Singapore. *Urban Studies* 52(1): 103-120.
- Mergenthaler, Marcus, Katinka Weinberger and Matin Qaim (2009) Consumer Valuation of Food Quality and Food Safety Attributes in Vietnam. *Review of Agricultural Economics* (31)2: 266–283.
- Morgan, Kevin (2015) Nourishing the city: The rise of the urban food question in the Global North. *Urban Studies* (52)8: 1379–1394.
- Mutz, Gerhard, Rainer Klump and Nicola Benda (2005) Introduction: Modernization and Social Transformation in Vietnam. Social Capital Formation and Institution Building. In: Mutz G and Klump R (eds) *Modernization and Social Transformation in Vietnam. Social Capital Formation and Institution Building*. Hamburg: Institut für Asienkunde, pp.17–29.
- Parnell, Susan and Edgar Pieterse (2010) The 'Right to the City': Institutional Imperatives of a Developmental State. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 34(1): 146-162.
- Polanyi, Karl (1977) *The Great Transformation*. Frankfurt: Suhrkamp.
- Putnam, Robert (2000) *Bowling alone. The Collapse and Revival of American Community*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- The Anh Duy et al. (2012) Food Safety Advocacy Report: Current situation of food safety law implementation and safe vegetables quality management. Hanoi: CASRAD and VECO.
- Turner, Sarah and Laura Schoenberger (2012) Street Vendor Livelihoods and Everyday Politics in Hanoi, Vietnam: The Seeds of a Diverse Economy? *Urban Studies* 49(5): 1027–1044.
- Van Nguyen (2014) Vietnam food regulatory challenges and harmonization of food standard in ASEAN. Report, American Chamber of Commerce, Food and Beverage Committee, Vietnam, March.
- Veblen, Thorstein (1899) *Theory of the Leisure Class: An Economic Study in the Evolution of Institutions*. New York: Macmillan.
- Vietnam Plus (2016) Health Ministry works to curb contaminated food.
Available at: en.vietnamplus.vn/health-ministry-works-to-curb-contaminated-food/88142.vnp (accessed 23 May 2016).
- Weatherspoon, Dave, James Oehmke, Assa Dembele and Lorraine Weatherspoon (2015) Fresh vegetable demand behavior in an urban food desert. *Urban Studies* 52 (5): 960-979.
- Weber, Max (1978) *Economy and Society*. Berkeley: University of California.
- Wertheim-Heck, Sigrid, Gert Spaargaren and Sietze Vellema (2014a) Food safety in everyday life: Shopping for vegetables in a rural city in Vietnam. *Journal of Rural Studies* 35: 37–48.
- Wertheim-Heck, Sigrid, Sietze Vellema and Gert Spaargaren (2014b) Constrained consumer practices and food safety concerns in Hanoi. *International Journal of Consumer Studies* 38(4): 326–336.
- Wertheim-Heck, Sigrid, Sietze Vellema and Gert Spaargaren (2015) Food safety and urban food markets in Vietnam: The need for flexible and customized retail modernization policies. *Food Policies* 54: 95–106.
- Whelan, Amanda, Neil Wrigley, Daniel Warm and Elizabeth Cannings (2002). Life in a 'Food Desert'. *Urban Studies* 39(11): 2083-2100.